LYNCH HERITAGE CONSULTING



STATEMENT OF HERITAGE IMPACT

Proposed Police Station Blende Street, Broken Hill

August 2020

POLICE STATION, BLENDE STREET, BROKEN HILL STATEMENT OF HERITAGE IMPACT

Issue A	23/04/2020	Draft for Review
Issue B	12/05/2020	Issued for DA Submission
Issue C	21/07/2020	Draft - Update Following Design Revision
Issue D	20/08/2020	Issued for DA Submission

Lynch Heritage Consulting acknowledges the Australian Aboriginal and Torres Strait Islander peoples as the first inhabitants of the nation and the traditional custodians of the lands where we live, learn and work.

Copyright of this report remains with the author, Lynch Heritage Consulting Pty Ltd

Lynch Heritage Consulting Pty Ltd PO Box 1232 Dee Why NSW 2099

e: gail@lynchheritage.com.au w: www.lynchheritage.com.au

ABN 19 002 284 844 ACN 002 284 844

CONTENTS

1.0	INTRODUCTION	4
1.1	REPORT OVERVIEW	4
1.2	METHODOLOGY AND STRUCTURE	4
1.3	REPORT LIMITATIONS	5
1.4	AUTHORSHIP	5
2.0	HISTORICAL SUMMARY	6
2.1	BRIEF HISTORY OF THE LOCALITY	6
2.2	THE SUBJECT SITE	
2.3	KINTORE RESERVE	9
2.4	THE KINTORE HEADFRAME	
3.0	SITE DESCRIPTION	13
4.0	DESCRIPTION OF THE PROPOSAL	19
5.0	ASSESSMENT OF HERITAGE IMPACT	21
5.1	HERITAGE MANAGEMENT FRAMEWORK	21
5.2	SIGNIFICANCE OF THE SUBJECT SITE	23
5.3	ESTABLISHED SIGNIFICANCE OF THE ARGENT STREET CONSERVATION AREA	_27
5.4	ESTABLISHED SIGNIFICANCE OF THE HERITAGE ITEMS IN THE VICINITY OF T	ΗE
	SUBJECT SITE	28
5.5	BROKEN HILL NATIONAL HERITAGE VALUES	.30
5.6	CONSIDERATION OF THE GUIDELINES OF THE NSW HERITAGE DIVISION	35
5.7	HERITAGE OBJECTIVES OF THE BROKEN HILL LEP 2013	
5.8	HERITAGE GUIDELINES OF THE BROKEN HILL DCP 2016	38
5.9	REQUIREMENTS OF THE EPBC ACT 1999	38
6.0	CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS	40
6.1	CONCLUSIONS	40
6.2	RECOMMENDATIONS	41
7.0	BIBLIOGRAPHY	42

1.0 INTRODUCTION

1.1 Report Overview

This Statement of Heritage Impact reviews the proposal for a new Police Station at Broken Hill that is to be located in Blende Street. It evaluates the proposal designed by Gardner Wetherill and Associates.

The subject site, described by NSW Land Registry Services (LRS) as Lot 91, Deposited Plan (DP) 1262325, is part of a larger site formerly identified as Lot 5893, DP 241855 and known as 51 Bromide Street, Broken Hill, that contains an item of local heritage significance, Item I84, Kintore Headframe and Kintore Reserve, listed in Schedule 5 of the *Broken Hill Local Environmental Plan (LEP) 2013.* It is also located within the C1 Argent Street Heritage Conservation Area, listed under the same LEP, and is in the vicinity of a number of individually listed items.

The property is subject to the heritage provisions of the *Broken Hill LEP 2013* and the *Broken Hill Development Control Plan (DCP) 2016* under the *Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979*. Broken Hill City Council must take into consideration the potential impact of any proposed development on the heritage significance of heritage conservation areas and items.

The City of Broken Hill is included on the National Heritage List (NHL) in recognition of the outstanding significance of Broken Hill to Australia. Sites on the NHL are protected by the *Environment Protection and Biodiversity Conservation Act 1999 (EPBC Act)*. Actions (the definition of which includes development) that have, or are likely to have, a significant impact on a matter of national environmental significance require approval from the Australian Government Minister for the Department of Agriculture, Water and the Environment.

Accordingly, this report also considers the likely impacts of the proposed development on the National Heritage values of the City of Broken Hill and whether or not it is an action that requires separate Federal Government approval under the *EPBC Act*.

It is understood that the circular railway track and associated items within the subject site that were present at the time of inspection are to be relocated by Broken Hill City Council prior to the commencement of any site works for this project. This report is limited to the assessment of the potential heritage impact of the proposed new building on the site.

The report includes a detailed analysis of the statutory heritage controls applying to the site and concludes that the proposal will not have an adverse impact on the established significance of the Argent Street Heritage Conservation Area or the listed heritage items in its vicinity and will not have a significant impact on the National heritage values of Broken Hill.

1.2 Methodology and Structure

This Statement of Heritage Impact has been prepared with reference to the guidelines outlined in the Australia ICOMOS Charter for Places of Cultural Significance, 2013, known as The Burra Charter, and associated series of Practice Notes, the New South Wales Heritage Office (now part of the NSW Department of Premier and Cabinet) publication, NSW Heritage Manual and the Australian Government Department of the Environment (now Department of Agriculture, Water and the Environment) publication Matters of National Environmental Significance Significant Impact Guidelines 1.1 Environment Protection and Biodiversity Conservation Act 1999.

The Burra Charter is a set of principles that have been adopted to create a nationally accepted standard for heritage conservation practice in Australia. It provides definitions for terms used in heritage conservation and proposes conservation processes and principles for the conservation of an item. The *NSW Heritage Manual* explains and promotes the standardisation of heritage investigation, assessment and management practices in NSW.

1.3 Report Limitations

This report is limited to the analysis of European cultural heritage values. The analysis and recommendations in this report are based on documentary evidence and information sourced as referenced and an inspection of the site and its surrounds.

Archaeological assessment of the subject site is outside the scope of this report.

This report only addresses the relevant heritage planning provisions and does not address general planning or environmental management considerations.

1.4 Authorship

This report has been prepared by Gail Lynch, M Herit Cons, Grad Dip URP, of Lynch Heritage Consulting. Unless otherwise noted, all of the photographs in this report are by Lynch Heritage Consulting.



Figure 1.1

Map showing the location of the approximate boundaries of the subject site marked in red Source: NSW LRS Sixviewer

2.0 HISTORICAL SUMMARY

2.1 Brief History of the Locality

The following summary history of Broken Hill is reproduced from the Australian Heritage Database entry for the National Heritage Listing of the City of Broken Hill¹:

Silver was first discovered at Broken Hill in 1883 by Charles Rasp, a boundary rider from Mt Gipps pastoral station. The Line of Lode, which was the name given to the vast ore seam, is the world's largest known lead-silver-zinc mineral deposit. By 1885, Broken Hill had become firmly established as a principal mining field and a syndicate of seven (including Rasp) set up the Broken Hill Proprietary Company Limited (known today as BHP Billiton) to raise capital to further exploit deposits. BHP Billiton is one of Australia's biggest companies and has played an important role in shaping Australia's mining and industrial policy. Other major world mining companies that have had their beginnings in Broken Hill include Rio Tinto, North Broken Hill Ltd, South Broken Hill Ltd and Pasminco Ltd.

A sub-division plan set in a grid pattern reflecting the orientation of the Line of Lode and mining leases was surveyed in 1886 three years after the discovery of the Lode by Charles Rasp.

Between 1885 and 1890, high grade and easy to mine and smelt ore was extracted from Broken Hill, mostly by BHP. However, in the 1890s, the mines struggled due to declining metal prices, lower ore grades and increasing sulphide problems. With increasingly poor working and living conditions, trade union activity began in Broken Hill as early as 1889 and the first strike took place in 1892. With a long history of strikes, the 1919-20 strike was the longest, lasting 18 months and bringing about a thirty-five hour week and improved health and safety conditions. One of the many achievements of unionism was the construction of the Trades Hall, commenced in 1898, and which was built in stages to house the 18 unions of Broken Hill that were affiliated with the Barrier Industrial Council.

The Australasian Institute of Mining and Metallurgy is a direct result of the Australasian Institute of Engineers which was founded in Broken Hill in 1893. Broken Hill has also been at the forefront of mining education and in particular environmental control and remediation of areas affected by mining. The city's role in the technological advancement of mining is significant as the invention and development of practical, hard-rock mining methods (particular hydraulic filling) which took place in Broken Hill.

The growth of the mines in Broken Hill resulted in an influx of miners and their families that deserted their prospecting activities around the Barrier Ranges. By 1886 the first smelters were brought into commission and Broken Hill began to emerge as a commercial, residential and service centre for mining activities. Broken Hill is renowned for its' strong community spirit and civic pride. Having survived a major depression, dust storms and decline in mining activity, the city much assisted by its original grid pattern plan, continues to function as a unique mining settlement in remote and arid conditions and as a service centre to the surrounding rural community. In 1888, it was declared a Municipal Council and by 1907 it was proclaimed a city.

With mining as its focus, the population of Broken Hill peaked at 35,000 in 1915 and again in 1952 when there was a population of 33,000. However since that time the population has been steadily declining as mines have closed. Although the population was predicted to fall to 15,000, today (2010) there are still about 19,000 people in the city with approximately 500 employed on the mines. With the fluctuations in metal prices and the possibility of mine closures in the future, the city is turning to sustainable cultural tourism as an important area of growth with heritage as a major attraction.

¹ http://www.environment.gov.au/cgi-bin/ahdb/search.pl?mode=place_detail;place_id=105861

Today the city continues to operate as a mining centre and more recently as a popular place for tourists, who appreciate the unique architectural styles and the rich mining history. The Broken Hill Council and community have developed the city as a 'Living Museum' in 1988, the first of its kind in Australia, with interpretive signs marking walking and driving trails. The city has also become increasingly popular for artists and film makers. The unique combination of landscape and relict infrastructure in Broken Hill has become the backdrop for over 50 feature films and television productions including Mission Impossible II, Mad Max II and The Adventures of Priscilla Queen of the Desert.

2.2 The Subject Site

The Government Gazette of 12 February 1887 gave notice that various parcels of Crown Land within the Town of Willyama (later named Broken Hill) were to be reserved from sale and used for public buildings, tramway, tramway station and trucking yards, public pound, and public recreation.² The subject site was included in land reserved for tramway use.³ Its location in relation to the Line of Load and the Broken Hill town centre is illustrated in Figure 2.1 below.



Figure 2.1

Depiction of part of the 1887 Willyama Town Plan with the location of the subject site (indicative boundaries only) coloured blue Source: Solomon R, The Richest Lode, Broken Hill 1883-1988, page 111

A rail link to South Australia was facilitated by the passing of "An Act to authorize the construction and maintenance of a Tramway from the terminus on the western boundary of the Colony of New South Wales of the South Australian Railway to Broken Hill. [14th October, 1886]" (the Silverton Tramway Act 1886) allowing the privately owned Silverton Tramway Company (STC) to construct and operate a rail service with a three foot six inch gauge (matching that used in South Australia) between Broken Hill and Cockburn via Silverton.⁴ The line was completed and opened for traffic on 12 January 1888.⁵ A subsequent amendment to the Silverton Tramway Act enabled the STC to extend the line to the BHP smelters⁶. An 1889 sketch, reproduced in Figure 2.2, provides a birds-eye view of Broken Hill at that time and shows the route of the Silverton Tramway passing through the subject site to Sulphide Street Station and illustrates the street crossings.

² New South Wales Government Gazette, 12 February 1887, pages 1050-1051

³ NSW HLRV, 1954 LTO Charting Map Town of Willyama Sheet 4

⁴ NSW Legislation, https://legislation.nsw.gov.au/acts/1886-sta.pdf

⁵ Roberts L, Rails to Wealth The Story of Silverton Tramway Company 1886-1972, page 259

⁶ Roberts L, Rails to Wealth The Story of Silverton Tramway Company 1886-1972, page 36



Figure 2.2

1889 sketch showing a birds-eye view of the town and the mines at that time, with the location of the subject site indicated with a red circle Source: Supplement to the "Illustrated Sydney News" March 7, 1889 NSW State Library online collection, call number M3 817.311/1889/1



Figure 2.3

Plan showing the use / activity of properties in the Broken Hill Commercial Centre in 1953, with the location of the subject site indicated with a red circle

Source: Solomon R, The Richest Lode, Broken Hill 1883-1988, page 169

The 1953 land use plan reproduced in Figure 2.3 shows additional uses introduced to the street block bounded by Kaolin, Beryl, Bromide and Blende Streets, including a tennis court on the subject site and a Caltex Oil Depot on the adjoining land.

The STC main line operated until 10 January 1970 when it was replaced with a new Commonwealth Government standard gauge rail line linking Broken Hill with the South Australia (SA) border at Cockburn.⁷

The New South Wales Government Gazette of 14 March 1975 gave notice that 1.215 hectares of Crown Land bounded by Kaolin, Beryl, Bromide and Blende Streets, Broken Hill was to be reserved from sale for use as a museum⁸. This was revoked in the Gazette of 6 March 1987 and it was declared that the land parcel of 1.215 hectares described as Lot 5893 DP 241855 was to be reserved for museum purposes.⁹ This is shown in the excerpt from an undated Land Titles Office Regional Charting Map reproduced below.

In 2001 the West Darling Machinery Preservation Society began running a restored Penrose Park Picnic Train on a circular track that was laid on the southern part of Lot 5893 DP 241855, the subject site, as part of a community project.¹⁰



Figure 2.4

Undated plan showing the street block bounded by Kaolin, Beryl, Bromide and Blende Streets dedicated for museum use on 6 March 1987. The indicative location of the subject is coloured in blue

Source: NSW HLRV Regional Charting Map Town of Willyama Sheet 4

2.3 Kintore Reserve

The northern part of the redundant STC land identified as Lot 5893 DP 241855 became known as Kintore Reserve. It was used to exhibit public art sculptures, including two by Pro Hart; The Ant, "*Dedicated to the workers of Broken Hill and their struggles to extract the wealth we all live from*", and End of Shift, which has faces depicting the moods of workers ascending from the mine at the end of their shift.

Redundant mining equipment and interpretation panels were also displayed in this area, including the headframe that had once stood over the No. 5 Shaft at the South Mine and was then relocated to the Kintore Shaft at the Central Mine,¹¹ and the street block became known as Kintore Reserve.

In 2005 Broken Hill City Council resolved to acquire Lot 5893, DP 241855, known as 51 Bromide Street, and classify it as 'operational land' under the *Local Government Act 1993*. It was subsequently converted to freehold title.¹²

⁷ Roberts L, Rails to Wealth The Story of Silverton Tramway Company 1886-1972, page 260

⁸ NSW Government Gazette Friday 14 March 1975, page 964

NSW Government Gazette Friday 6 March 1987, page 1257
Barrier Daily Truth "Picnic Train happy on tracks", Thursday, 14th February, 2019

¹⁰ Barrier Daily Truth Pichic Train happy on 11 Kintore Headframe Interpretation Panel

¹² Email correspondence from Broken Hill City Council, 5 February 2020

LYNCH

At its meeting of 31 July 2019 Broken Hill City Council resolved to subdivide the land at 51 Bromide Street and negotiate the sale of the southern portion of the site (the subject site).¹³ A development application for the subdivision (DA 154/2019) was approved on 26 November 2019 and an agreement has since been reached with NSW Police to acquire it and build a new station on the subject site. The subdivision and subsequent land sale reduces the size of Kintore Reserve to be 6112 square metres at the northern half of the street block bounded by Kaolin, Beryl, Bromide and Blende Streets, with frontages to Beryl, Bromide and Blende Streets.

2.4 The Kintore Headframe

The text on the interpretation panel adjacent to the headframe in Kintore Reserve states:

This headframe was previously located at the Kintore Shaft, principal shaft of the Central Mine. The shaft, commenced in 1903, was named after the the Earl of Kintore, Chairman of Directors of the Central Mine. The mine was worked between 1884 and 1940 producing six million tons of ore. It was reworked by Broken Hill South Ltd, using Kintore Shaft, from 1944 to 1959.

In 1945, the old headframe over Kintore Shaft was replaced with this headframe, which came from No. 5 Shaft at the South Mine. A timber and iron structure was built to house a new electric winding engine adjacent to the old stone winderhouse.

The headframe is constructed of oregon and is supported on concrete footings and cross-braced with steel rods. It allowed access to to the mine and extraction of the remaining ore in the upper levels. Steel headframes replaced wooden headframes after 1930.

The old mine buildings were demolished and the headframe was relocated to this site as a community project in 1984 to allow open cut mining of the original site.

The following notes extracted from the Historical Background section of the 1994 *Broken Hill Line of Load Identification Study* provide further detail on the shafts at the South and Central Mines. The report states that the historical information in this section was sourced from the records of Broken Hill South Ltd, The Broken Hill Proprietary Co Ltd (BHP), The BHP Block 10 Co. Ltd, The BHP BLock 14 Co Ltd, THe British BHP Co, the Junction Mine Company, and the Sulphide Corporation.

1885	the Broken Hill South Silver Mining Company Ltd was formed to work the South Mine on mining leases 7 and 8. Development operations commenced and the company began mining oxidised ores and selling extracted material to neighbouring companies who were operating lead smelters.
1903	The new main shaft No.1 was reported in 1903 to be sunk down to 278 feet (it appears as though this shaft began between 1900 and 1903).
1904	The main shaft at this time was No. 2 Shaft No. 1 reached a depth of 774 feet and a powerful new steam driven winding engine was ordered, and then installed by the end of the year 1904
1905	By 1905 shaft No. 1 had reached a depth of 1003 feet with workings opened out from the 970 foot level
1906	No. 5 shaft was reported to have been cleared out for open cutting. This was the first time this shaft appeared named as No. 5, however, it does show up unnamed on the 1904 plan.
1912	The south end of the mine was opened up in 1912 with the sinking of 88 feet in the No. 5 shaft. and by the end of the year No. 5 shaft was down to 378 feet, No. 1 shaft had reached 1164.5 feet and the more recent No. 4 was at 1137 feet.

Broken Hill South Ltd and Mining Leases 7 and 8

¹³ Broken Hill City Council, Minutes of Ordinary Meeting held on 31 July 2019

1913	No.1 shaft was further sunk to 1315.5 feet, No. 2 shaft was reopened and sunk to 1403 feet, No. 4 was stripped to become a haulage shaft with sinking down to 1201.5 feet, while No. 5 reached 772.5 feet. Shafts 4 and 5 had their winding engines ordered	
1914	The war also led to the suspension of all work on the installation of the No. 5 shaft winding gear The sinking gear for shaft No. 1 was dismantled and transferred to shaft No. 3 for restarting.	
1915	No.5 shaft headframe and winder equipment were also completed. The No.4 shaft headgear remained unfinished The No.3 shaft reached 1391.5 feet.	
1918	the Broken Hill South Silver Mining Company became Broken Hill South Ltd	
1921	The No. 5 shaft poppet head was completed with winding drums, brake gear and an operating platform.	
1932	No. 5 shaft was equipped with a ventilation fan. The No.1 shaft was closed down on 14th October.	
1940	Broken Hill South Ltd pegged the leases on the north side of the mine which used to belong to the Sulphide Corporation	
1943	Kintore Shaft on the Central Mine lease was re-open in 1945 with the headframe and winding gear transferred to it from the now closed No. 5 shaft. The winder house and engine house were also re-established.	

The Central Mine, Sulphide Corporation and Mining Lease 9

1884	Block 9 was initially pegged in 1884 by Thomas Nutt who set up his own company called Nutt's Broken Hill Silver Mining Co Ltd and named the mining site "Elizabeth" after his wife.	
1886	Nutt died in 1886 and his company was sold to a new company called "Central Broken Hill Silver Mining N.L." who mined the area with one shaft. The company folded in 1882 [1892] due to their inability to treat sulphides.	
1895	the Sulphide Corporation took over. The Central Mining Co had been mining through the Kintore Shaft (later known as the old Kintore Shaft) and had a second shaft cut for hauling.	
1902	A serious creep killed two people. A decision was made to cut a new haulage shaft to facilitate greater access to the orebody.	
1903	second shaft was cut	
1905	Another very serious creep in 1905 destroyed almost all of the buildings and both of the original shafts but the recently cut haulage shaft allowed operations to restart again quickly. This shaft was named the New Kintore Shaft.	
1908-1909	To avoid further problems with the creep all the buildings were relocated to the Kintore cut area	
1940	the Sulphide Corporation closed in 1940, the headframes were demolished and the leases were taken over by Broken Hill South Ltd.	
1945	During WWII the mine lay dormant but was reopened in 1945 and the headframe and winder engine from the No. 5 shaft were brought in and re-erected over the Kintore Shaft. Some modification was required of the cages because of the shape difference between the two shafts.	
1959	Operations had ceased by 1959 and the area lay dormant once again until MMM [Mining, Minerals and Metallurgy Pty Ltd] took over the leases in 1972	
Early 1980s	Further development of the MMM mining area in the 1980s was to put the Kintore cut area under threat with an intended two stage project of open cut mining. The fist stage was adjacent to the Kintore area and the second stage required the full use of old Kintore cut. In September 1981 an Interim Conservation Order was placed on the site by the Heritage Council of N.S.W. This followed by a request from Broken Hill City Council to have a Permanent Conservation Order placed. However, this request caused considerable controversy in Broken Hill. It was suggested that the order would prevent the open cut mining of the adjacent areas, which had not been fully mined due to the early creep. Council eventually reversed its decision, and the interim order lapsed.	
1986	the buildings were demolished to make way for stage 2 of the Kintore Open cut mining project, and the headframe was dismantled and then re-erected in Kintore Reserve in the city.	



Figure 2.5

Plan showing the location and ownership of the Broken Hill leases as at 1893. The Kintore Headframe was over the No.5 Shaft of the South Mine between 1904 and 1945 and was moved to the Central Mine on Block 9 in 1945 Source: Kearns R H B, Broken Hill 1883-1893, inside back cover



Figure 2.6

1953 plan of the central leases showing the location of the Kintore Shaft (marked with an arrow) within Block 9 that was leased by Broken Hill South Limited at that time

Source: Solomon R, The Richest Lode, Broken Hill 1883-1988, page 59

3.0 SITE DESCRIPTION

The following description of Broken Hill is reproduced from the Australian Heritage Database entry for the National Heritage Listing of the City of Broken Hill¹:

The City of Broken Hill Local Government Area includes the whole urban area of Broken Hill, the surrounding non-urban areas containing extensive areas in the course of regeneration, the extensive mullock heaps, tailings, skimps and slagheap along the Line of Lode, the remaining gossan outcrops, and mining leases.

The Line of Lode contains extensive intact physical and archaeological evidence of the mining that has occurred at Broken Hill since the discovery of ore in 1883. This evidence includes remains of surface workings such as headframes, winding houses, change rooms, crushers, concentrating mills, mine offices, all current mining operations, as well as rail, road and airport facilities. Associated with the mines are sporting and recreational facilities, power and compressed air lines, conveyors, mullock heaps, tailings, skimps and slagheap and the two power houses. The mining structures sit mostly on the ridge and the mullock heaps, tailings, skimps and slagheap follow along the Line of Lode. The Line of Lode extends in both directions beyond 'the hill' into undulating terrain in a north-east south-west direction. The line is reflected in the orientation of the mining leases. The infrastructure allows easy appreciation of the extent and nature of mining.

Broken Hill is an intact mining city, represented largely by the ongoing mining industry, together with the services and urban development built during its periods of urban growth, firstly during the late nineteenth century and latterly during the first half of the twentieth century. Mining development following World War II had an impact on the mining infrastructure. Broken Hill retains significant civic buildings, substantial private retail and commercial buildings, and surrounding residential areas all of which are largely intact and generally not subject in recent times to major redevelopment or expansionist pressures, due to the winding down of mining activity and consequently a relatively static population. The Line of Lode with its headframes and other mining infrastructure provides a powerful physical setting and backdrop for the city, an ever present reminder of its important mining legacy.

Condition and Integrity

Broken Hill is an intact mining town with a strong historic character, and apart from mining operations, it has not been impacted upon by changes to its urban structure or redevelopment, or by social or technological change that has affected other communities. It retains its 1883 grid plan character with the business centre located where it began on Argent Street in the 1880s. Although some changes of an adverse nature to some of its heritage buildings have occurred, such as the demolition in 2000 of the 1941 art deco/moderne base hospital and relocation of the Broken Hill Council offices from Argent Street, Broken Hill retains significant civic buildings, substantial private retail and commercial buildings, and surrounding residential areas all of which are largely intact, without the typical demolition and intrusion of new unsympathetically scaled buildings common in other regional cities. The backdrop of the Line of Lode provides an unusual physical setting for the city, and an ever present reminder of its important mining legacy.

The subject site is 6038 square metres of vacant land with frontages to Blende. Kaolin and Beryl Streets. It is located at the south west edge of the Argent Street Heritage Conservation Area which is generally bounded by Crystal, Kaolin, Beryl and Iodide Streets, with extensions to include Broken Hill Railway Station, the former Broken Hill Munitions Annex and the Old Willyama Hotel.

Kintore Reserve adjoins the subject site to the north. It contains bitumen surfaced vehicle parking, conservation gardens, large items of public art, the Lions Recreational Reserve, the Kintore Headframe from the Central Mine and a winder and an air compressor from the North Mine, with accompanying interpretation panels.

The location of the listed heritage items in the immediate vicinity of the site is shown in Figure 3.1. The context of the subject site is illustrated in the following photographs and described in their captions.

¹ http://www.environment.gov.au/cgi-bin/ahdb/search.pl?mode=place_detail;place_id=105861



Aerial photograph marked up to show the approximate boundaries of the subject site outlined in red and the location of the listed heritage items in the vicinity Source: NSW LRS Sixmaps



Figure 3.2

Looking north along Beryl Street from the intersection with Kaolin Street with the subject site on the right and the residential development on the western side of Beryl Street on the left



View to the subject site and beyond from the corner of Kaolin and Beryl Streets



Looking north along Blende Street from the intersection with Kaolin Street with the subject site on the left and the development on the eastern side of Blende Street on the right



Figure 3.5

Boarding House (former Adelaide Hotel) at 97-99 Blende Street, opposite Kintore Reserve



Figure 3.6

View of Broken Hill High School from Blende Street with the land acquired after the closing of the Silverton Tramway in the foreground and the 1907 building that previously fronted Beryl Street on the left of the image



Figure 3.7

The Black Lion Hotel at the corner of Blende and Bromide Streets, north east of the subject site



Figure 3.8

View to the rear of the former Munitions Annex from the corner of Kaolin and Beryl Street



Figure 3.9 The main, Argent Street, frontage of the former Muntions Annex



Partial view of Kintore Reserve from Blende Street, opposite Sulphide Street Station



Figure 3.11

View of Kintore Reserve from Blende Street showing the Central Mine's Kintore Headframe with the winding drum from Shaft No. 1 at the North Mine that were relocated in the 1980s



Figure 3.12

View looking across Kintore Reserve to Blende Street showing the headframe, on the left, and the Boarding House (former Adelaide Hotel) in the centre of the background. The subject site is seen on the right and is separated by a wire fence





The Ant Sculpture, by Broken Hill artist Pro Hart, in a garden at Kintore Reserve with the headframe visible in the background



Figure 3.14

View of Sulphide Street Station looking south west along Blende Street towards the subject site



Figure 3.15 The main elevation of Sulphide Street Station



Remnant rail track and information panel near the corner of Beryl and Oxide Street interpreting the alignment of the Silverton Tramway Company line that ran through the town



Figure 3.17

Historic commercial buildings in Argent Street between Delamore and Oxide Streets, within the Argent Street Heritage Conservation Area



Figure 3.18

Civic buildings in the Argent Street Heritage Conservation Area, between Sulphide and Chloride Streets, include the Town Hall facade, Police Station and Technical College



Figure 3.19 The existing Broken Hill Police Station in Argent Street



Figure 3.20

The Broken Hill Community Health Centre at the corner of Sulphide and Crystal Streets, a recently completed infill development within the Argent Street Heritage Conservation Area

LYNCH HERITAGE CONSULTING



Figure 3.21

View of the Broken Hill Community Health Centre building, looking east along Sulphide Street with the mullock heap and the Line of Load Miners Memorial and Visitor Centre, that won a 2001 Walter Burley Griffin Design Award, in the background



Figure 3.22 View of Broken Hill from the JP Keenan Lookout with the location of the Kintore Headframe marked with a red arrow. The subject site is to the right of the headframe



Figure 3.23

View of Broken Hill from the mullock heap with the location of the Kintore Headframe marked with a red arrow. The subject site is on the left of the image

4.0 DESCRIPTION OF THE PROPOSAL

The project seeks to relocate police services in Broken Hill to a new, purpose built facility bringing all areas of crime management and police administration under one roof. It includes an L-shaped, two level building, garages, carports and other covered structures and uncovered parking, and associated landscaping.

The aim of the proposal is to provide modern, functional, and fit for purpose facilities in an energy and water efficient building. It has been designed by Gardner Wetherill and Associates and is described in the following extracts from their architect's design statement:

The new Police Station facility is approx. 2600m2 in gross floor area and constructed over two floor levels, with undercover secure parking for 21 operation vehicles, 4 trailers, a Post Command vehicle, a Vehicle Examination Bay, Custody Van Dock, Vehicle Wash Bay, motor bikes and bicycle parking, with site drive through access between Blende and Beryl Streets.

The planning and design of the Broken Hill Police Station responds to the accommodation schedule and respective design and Police building codes prepared by NSW Police, to house the required specific Police units, user groups and staff that make up this Police Area Command station.

In response to the earlier prepared Urban Design Report, the building footprint was preferred and agreed with NSW Police to be of an 'L-Shape' plan fronting Blende and Kaolin Streets and orientated around a landscaped Courtyard to maximise north and north/western light to the internal façade of the building.

The concept for the appearance of the proposed Police Station respects the roof form, selected materials and finishes of local Australian vernacular 'outback' architecture, but reflected in a modern contemporary building with raw materials, textures earthy colours, but still with the ability to be immediately recognisable as a law enforcement public authority to be shared with the community to encourage a positive social attitude towards NSW Police

It is noted that the proposed site is located at the southwest fringe of the main commercial/retail area of Blende and Argent Streets and positioned at the transition of the residential area, hence the preference to integrate a more appropriate domestic roof form and pitch, that is more sympathetic with the immediate area, where corrugated roofs, broad eaves protection and expressed roof drainage are common.

Materials and Finishes

In addition to the building form, the selection of traditional materials that are associated with vernacular usage or compatible with the vernacular, and in a sense, represent a sensible modern extension of climatically appropriate design.

The use of corrugated steel [roofing] typifies early Australian vernacular architecture, and is intended to be finished in traditional zincalume, not a pre-coloured Colorbond product, which is more recognisable with suburban and coastal projects.

Similar with guttering and downpipes, it is the intent to provide generous half round gutters and circular downpipes finished in zincalume steel.

The inclusion of 'Corten', being a copper chromium alloy steel where its chemical composition promotes the early weathering formation of an adhering protective layer of rust when exposed to the elements, has been introduced in contemporary buildings over recent years, and more appropriate in this local rural miming environment, as seen in the new Broken Hill Community Health Centre, on the corner of Sulphide and Crystal Streets. As a secondary high-level building cladding element, it is proposed to incorporate Lysaght 'Mini Orb' horizontal sheeting, finished in natural zincalume. Again, corrugated steel has been typically used over the past two centuries as external sheet cladding, and again forms a traditional Australian vernacular finish as a robust and durable protective sheeting.

It is proposed to include natural anodised aluminium window and door frames with green tinted glazing, with appropriate U and SHGC values in accordance with the requirements of the ESD/Section J Consultants.

Over the past decade, NSW Police Stations have introduced a Statement Feature Wall on arrival, of blue highly glazed brickwork (equal to Austral 'Burlesque series' – Smashing Blue), which immediately identifies for the public, a NSW Police Station. The wall will also include the name 'Broken Hill Police Station'.

The low level and ground floor portion of the building is proposed to be constructed and faced in a dark brick, equal to Austral 'Bowral 50 – Bowral Blue Bricks with dark grey mortar joints, forming a heavy base to the two storey building with lighter materials and colours above.

To address solar control penetration to the external glazing, sun shading will be provided in the form of fixed horizontal natural anodised aluminium louvres, secured proud approx. 400mm off the façade of the building to enable cleaning and maintenance.



Figure 4.1

Artist impression of the proposed development as it will be viewed from the corner of Blende and Kaolin Streets Source: Gardner Wetherill and Associates

5.0 ASSESSMENT OF HERITAGE IMPACT

5.1 Heritage Management Framework

The subject site is identified on the *Broken Hill LEP 2013* Heritage Map (Map 5A) as being part of Heritage Item 184, Kintore Headframe and Kintore Reserve, and is located within the C1 Argent Street Heritage Conservation Area, listed in Schedule 5 of the *Broken Hill LEP 2013* as a conservation area of local heritage significance. It is also in the vicinity of a number of individually listed items listed under the same LEP, the closest being:

- Item I19, Boarding house, 97–99 Blende Street
- Item I27, Broken Hill Munitions Annex (former), 60 Argent Street
- Item I24, Broken Hill High School (buildings), police house and teacher housing (2 units), 76 Garnet Street and 41 and 43 Wolfram Street
- I209 Sulphide Street Station (Railway Museum), 230 Blende Street.
- I17 Black Lion Hotel (former Federal Hotel),159 Blende Street.

As such, the property is subject to the heritage provisions of the *Broken Hill LEP 2013* and the *Broken Hill DCP 2016* under the *Environmental Planning and Assessment Act 1979*. Broken Hill City Council must take into consideration the potential impact of any proposed development on the heritage significance of the heritage conservation area and adjacent items.



Figure 5.1

Extract from the Broken Hill LEP 2013 Heritage Map 5A showing the approximate boundaries of the subject site outlined in blue. Heritage items are coloured brown and the Argent Street Heritage Conservation Area is hatched in red Source: legislation.nsw.gov.au

As the subject site is not included on the New South Wales State Heritage Register(SHR) there are no heritage approvals required under the *NSW Heritage Act 1977* other than those that may be applicable to archaeology.

The City of Broken Hill is included on the National Heritage List (NHL) in recognition of the outstanding significance of Broken Hill to Australia. Sites on the NHL are protected by the *Environment Protection and Biodiversity Conservation Act 1999 (EPBC Act)*. Actions (the definition of which includes development) that have, or are likely to have, a significant impact on a matter of national environmental significance require approval from the Australian Government Minister for the Department of Agriculture, Water and the Environment.

Accordingly, this report also considers the likely impacts of the proposed development on the National Heritage values of the City of Broken Hill and whether or not it is an action that requires separate Federal Government approval under the *EPBC Act*.



Figure 5.2

Map showing the boundaries of the national heritage listing for Broken Hill outlined in red. This listing comprises the whole of the Broken Hill City Council Local Government Area

Source: http://www.environment.gov.au/heritage/places/national/city-broken-hill

This section of the report provides a detailed analysis of the statutory controls applying to the subject site, with regard to heritage. It has been prepared with reference to the guidelines outlined in the *Australia ICOMOS Charter for Places of Cultural Significance, 2013*, known as *The Burra Charter*, and associated series of Practice Notes, the New South Wales Heritage Office (now part of the NSW Department of Premier and Cabinet) publication, *NSW Heritage Manual* and the Australian Government Department of the Environment (now Department of Agriculture, Water and the Environment) publication *Matters of National Environmental Significance Significant Impact Guidelines 1.1 Environment Protection and Biodiversity Conservation Act 1999.*

5.2 Significance of the Subject Site

The subject site, in Blende Street, Broken Hill, was formerly part of Lot 5893, DP 241855, known as 51 Bromide Street, which is listed in Schedule 5 of the *Broken Hill LEP 2013* as Item I84, Kintore Headframe and Kintore Reserve. Although the LEP Heritage Map shows the whole of the street block bounded by Kaolin, Beryl, Bromide and Blende Streets as being Item I84, the 2019 subdivision of this land has reduced the curtilage of Kintore Reserve to the boundaries of Lot 92, DP 1262315. The subject site, Lot 91, DP 1262315 is a parcel of vacant land adjoining Kintore Reserve.

The NSW Heritage Inventory has a database entry for Kintore Reserve, database entry number 1240234, that classifies it as a landscape item and has no Statement of Significance or description.

Most of Broken Hill City Council's Heritage Inventory listings are documented in the *Broken Hill Heritage Study A Tale of Tin and Silver* (1987) and the *Argent Street Urban Design Study* (1988). As these were prepared before Kintore Reserve, at the corner of Blende and Bromide Streets, was added to the *Broken LEP 1996* Heritage Schedule, as item number I235 on 28 February 1997, there is no listing sheet information available in these documents. When the *Broken Hill LEP 2013* came into force on 30 August 2013 the item numbering was revised and this item was included as number I84 and described as Kintore Headframe and Kintore Reserve, 51 Bromide Street.

The following commentary reviews the significance of the subject site, the Kintore Headframe and Kintore Reserve in relation to each of the criteria established by the New South Wales Heritage Office (now part of the NSW Department of Premier and Cabinet).

Criterion (a) – An item is important in the course, or pattern, of NSW's cultural or natural history (or the cultural or natural history of the local area)

Guidelines for Inclusion: When the item shows evidence of a significant human activity or is associated with a significant activity of historical phase. When it maintains or shows the continuity of a historical process or activity.

Guidelines for Exclusion: When the item has incidental or unsubstantiated connections with historically important activities or processes. When it provides evidence of activities or processes that are of dubious historical importance or has been so altered that it can no longer provide evidence of a particular association

The street block bounded by Kaolin, Beryl, Bromide and Blende Street was part of land that was gazetted as being reserved for use as a tramway on 12 February 1887. The narrow gauge rail line connecting Broken Hill with Cockburn at border of New South Wales and South Australia ran through this land between 1888 and 1972. The rail service, operated by the privately owned Silverton Tramway Company (STC), hauled vast quantities of minerals from Broken Hill to South Australia where it could be transported to world markets. It also facilitated the development of pastoral industry on stations around Broken Hill from the late 19th century.

There is no built evidence of this use remaining on the site.

The Penrose Park picnic train and its associated elements, that operated on a circular track at the southern part of Kintore Reserve (subject site) from 2001, interpreted one of the services provided by the STC. This is to continue at a new location.

The Kintore Headframe from the Central Mine and the winding drum and air compressor from the No.1 shaft of the North Mine were moved to Kintore Reserve in the 1980s to facilitate their conservation when it was planned to convert the areas around their shafts to open cut mining. Whilst they have no historic links with this land they are part of the interpretation program within the Broken Hill city centre.

Criterion (b) - An item has strong or special association with the life or works of a person, or group of persons, of importance in NSW's cultural or natural history (or the cultural or natural history of the local area)

Guidelines for Inclusion: When an item shows evidence of a significant human occupation or is associated with a significant event, person or group of persons.

Guidelines for Exclusion: When an item has incidental or unsubstantiated connections with historically important people or events. When it provides evidence of people or events that are of dubious historical importance or has been so altered that it can no longer providence evidence of a particular association

The route of the STC rail connection between the Broken Hill mines and Cockburn has associations with the board and staff of the company and the users of the service. No built evidence from the operation of this service remains on the subject site or within Kintore Reserve.

The headframe in Kintore Reserve stood above the No.5 shaft of the South Mine (1904- 1945) and the (New) Kintore Shaft of the Central Mine (1945-1986). The shaft was named after Lord Kintore, Algernon Keith-Falconer, 9th Earl of Kintore, who was the governor of South Australia between 1889 and 1895¹.

Kintore Reserve contains two sculptures by well known Broken Hill artist, Pro Hart (1928-2006), The Ant and End of Shift.

Criterion (c) - An item is important in demonstrating aesthetic characteristics and/or a high degree of creative or technical achievement in NSW (or the local area)

Guidelines for Inclusion: When an item shows or is associated with, creative or technical innovation or achievement. When it is the inspiration for a creative or technical innovation or achievement, is aesthetically distinctive, has landmark qualities or exemplifies a particular taste, style or technology.

Guidelines for Exclusion: When an item is not a major work by an important designer or artist, has lost its design or technical integrity. When an item's positive visual or sensory appeal or landmark and scenic qualities have been more than temporarily degraded or has only a loose association with a creative or technical achievement

Although the significance of the headframe, winding drum and air compressor in Kintore Reserve has been reduced by moving them away from the mines in the 1980s, they provide evidence and interpretation of the infrastructure and technology in use in the Broken Hill mines in the late 19th and early 20th centuries.

The Kintore Headframe is a land mark in the local area.

Criterion (d) - An item has strong or special association with a particular community or cultural group in NSW (or the local area) for social, cultural or spiritual reasons

Guidelines for Inclusion: When an item is important for its association with an identifiable group or is important to a community's sense of place.

Guidelines for Exclusion: When an item is only important to the community for amenity reasons or is retained only in preference to a proposed alternative.

The subject site and Kintore Reserve are part of land that was reserved for museum use in 1987. Community interest saw the Kintore Headframe from the Central Mine and the winding drum and air compressor from the North Mine relocated to Kintore Reserve to ensure they were conserved when these areas were converted to open cut mining.

Australian Dictionary of Biography, http://adb.anu.edu.au/biography/kintore-ninth-earl-of-3963

The volunteer West Darling Machinery Preservation Society ran a restored Picnic Train on a circular track on the subject site for nearly twenty years from 2001.

Criterion (e) - An item has potential to yield information that will contribute to an understanding of NSW's cultural or natural history (or the cultural or natural history of the local area)

Guidelines for Inclusion: When an item has the potential to yield new or further substantial scientific and/or archaeological information. When it is an important benchmark or reference site or type or provides evidence of past human cultures that is unavailable elsewhere.

Guidelines for Exclusion: When the knowledge gained would be irrelevant on science, human history or culture. When the item has little archaeological or research potential or only contains information that is readily available from other resources or archaeological sites. Where the knowledge gained would be irrelevant to research on science, human history or culture.

As a vacant block of land, the subject site has no potential to yield information relating to the built environment.

The redundant headframe and other machinery in Kintore Reserve, and their associated interpretation panels, contribute to the public's understanding of Broken Hill's mining history.

Criterion (f) - An item possesses uncommon, rare or endangered aspects of NSW's cultural or natural history (or the cultural or natural history of the local area)

Guidelines for Inclusion: Where an item provides evidence of a defunct custom, way of life or process or demonstrates a process, custom or other human activity that is in danger of being lost. Where it shows unusually accurate evidence of a significant human activity or is the only example of its type. When an item demonstrates designs or techniques of exceptional interest or shows rare evidence of a significant human activity important to a community.

Guidelines for Exclusion: When an item is not rare or is numerous and not under threat.

A comparative analysis study to assess the rarity of the Kintore Headframe and the winding drum and compressor from the North Mine is outside the scope of this report.

Criterion (g) - An item is important in demonstrating the principal characteristics of a class of NSW's cultural or natural places; or cultural or natural environments (or a class of the local area's cultural or natural places; or cultural or natural environments)

Guidelines for Inclusion: When an item is a fine example of its type or has the principal characteristics of an important class or group of items. When an item has attributes typical of a particular way of life, philosophy, custom, significant process, design, technique or activity or is a significant variation to a class of items. Where it is outstanding because of its setting, condition or size or may be part of a group, which collectively illustrates a representative type. When an item is outstanding because of its integrity of the esteem in which it is held.

Guidelines for Exclusion: When an item is a poor example of its type or does not include or has lost the range of characteristics of a type. An item that does not represent well the characteristics that constitutes a type or variation from it.

The subject site is a vacant block of land.

The Kintore Headframe is an example of mining infrastructure designed in the late 19th century. The winding drum and air compressor from the North Mine are examples of early 20th century equipment used at the Broken Hill mines.

Statements of Significance

The Subject Site - Vacant Land, Lot 91 DP 1262315

The vacant block of land identified as Lot 91, DP 1262315, that has frontages to Blende, Kaolin and Beryl Streets is located at the outer edge of Broken Hill's city centre. It is part of land that was gazetted as being reserved from sale, to be used as a tramway, on 12 February 1887. The narrow gauge Silverton Tramway Company rail line connecting Broken Hill with Cockburn, at the border of New South Wales and South Australia, ran across this land between 1888 and 1972. The privately owned Silverton Tramway Company rail service hauled vast quantities of minerals from Broken Hill to South Australia where it could be transported to world markets, and carried supplies and passengers to the town. It facilitated the development of pastoral industry on stations around Broken Hill from the late 19th century. There is no built evidence of this use on the site.

The reservation for tramway use was revoked following the cessation of the Silverton Tramway Company service and the land was rededicated for museum use, and later became operational Council land. The site has recent associations with the volunteer West Darling Machinery Preservation Society whose members ran a restored Penrose Park picnic train on a circular track for twenty years from 2001.

The subject site does not meet the threshold for LEP listing as an individual item of heritage.

Kintore Headframe and Kintore Reserve

Kintore Reserve, identified as Lot 92, DP 1262315, has frontages to Blende, Bromide and Beryl Streets at the outer edge of Broken Hill's city centre. It is part of land that was gazetted as being reserved from sale, to be used as a tramway, on 12 February 1887. The narrow gauge Silverton Tramway Company rail line connecting Broken Hill with Cockburn, at the border of New South Wales and South Australia, ran across this land between 1888 and 1972. The privately owned Silverton Tramway Company rail service hauled vast quantities of minerals from Broken Hill to South Australia where it could be transported to world markets, and carried supplies and passengers to the town. It facilitated the development of pastoral industry on stations around Broken Hill from the late 19th century. There is no built evidence of this use on the site.

The reservation for tramway use was revoked following the cessation of the Silverton Tramway Company service and the land was rededicated for museum use, and later became operational Council land.

Development within the public reserve includes bitumen surfaced vehicle parking, conservation gardens, two large items of public art by well known Broken Hill artist Pro Hart (1928-2006), The Ant and End of Shift, the Kintore Headframe from the Central Mine and a winder and an air compressor from the North Mine, with accompanying interpretation panels. These redundant mining infrastructure elements were moved in the 1980s to facilitate their conservation when it was planned to convert the areas around their shafts to open cut mining. Whilst they have no historic links with this land they are part of the interpretation program within the Broken Hill city centre and the headframe is a local landmark.

The Kintore Headframe was initially erected over the No. 5 shaft of the South Mine in 1904 and was moved to the Kintore Shaft on the Central mine in 1945, along with its winding gear, where it remained in operation until 1959. The shaft was named after Lord Kintore, Algernon Keith-Falconer, 9th Earl of Kintore, who was the governor of South Australia between 1889 and 1895.

The winding drum installed as part of the interpretive display of mining infrastructure dates from 1908 when it was used at Shaft No. 1 of the North Mine in conjunction with a steam engine that was later converted to electric drive. The Bellis and Morcom self lubricating air compressor was also installed at this shaft in 1908.

Community interest saw the Kintore Headframe from the Central Mine and the winding drum and air compressor from the North Mine relocated to Kintore Reserve to ensure they were conserved when these areas were converted to open cut mining.

5.3 Established Significance of the Argent Street Conservation Area

The subject site is located within the boundaries of the C1 Argent Street Heritage Conservation Area which is listed as an area of local significance on Schedule 5 of the *Broken Hill LEP 2013*. The conservation area is generally bounded by Crystal, Kaolin, Beryl and Iodide Streets with extensions to include Broken Hill Railway Station, the former Broken Hill Munitions Annex and the Old Willyama Hotel.

The NSW Heritage Inventory has no information for this conservation area. The following Statement of Significance is sourced from the 1998 Argent Street Urban Design Study Heritage Analysis and Recommendations Volume One, prepared by McDougall and Vines.

The Argent Street precinct is historically significant because:

- It was the site of development of commerce associated with the initial mining activity on the line of load. Argent Street was the track at the foot of the hill and was cut and levelled in 1885 and is parallel to the line of load.
- It has been the focus for strikes, parades, demonstrations, celebrations and other gatherings as reflected in the wealth of early photographs of the precinct. As such it has provided a venue for expressions of community concern and solidarity for the rights of the individual.
- The surviving grand buildings reflect the commercial prosperity and confidence created by mining only twenty years after white settlement in arid and inhospitable conditions.

The Argent Street precinct in Broken Hill is architecturally and environmentally significant for:

- the collection of well detailed, stylistically excellent commercial buildings, many of which were designed by well known Adelaide architects of the period
- the collection of exceptionally fine and substantially intact public buildings on the west side of the street between Sulphide and Chloride Streets which form a group of national significance
- development of building form, particularly the surviving verandahs which were developed as a means of coping with the harsh, inland climate
- remnants of early c1890 iron and stone commercial buildings which testify to the difficulties of early settlement on the town
- the broad uninterrupted street with wide swales to accommodate occasional storm bursts
- The views south-east from the Argent Street intersections to the line of load which forms a physical backdrop and enclosure to the precinct
- the collections of substantial hotels, located on street intersections which create strong and imposing corners. These are the best collection of grand Victorian hotels in New South Wales.

The 2008 Broken Hill City Council Heritage Assessment and Analysis, prepared by High Ground Consulting, notes

The principal defining characteristics of this zone are:

- The commercial area extending from Crystal to Beryl Street. This area contains most of Broken Hill's Civic buildings, hotels and stores.
- The former alignment of the Silverton Tramway, including Kintore Reserve, Broken Hill Council Offices and Chambers and Broken Hill Civic Centre.

5.4 Established Significance of the Heritage Items in the Vicinity of the Subject Site

There are a number of individually listed heritage items in the vicinity of the subject site, identified as items of local heritage significance on Schedule 5 of the *Broken Hill LEP 2013*. The analysis in this report focuses on the impact of the proposed development (if any) on the following items as the other listed heritage items in the wider locality are physically and visually separated from the subject site by roadways and intervening development:

- Item I19, Boarding house, 97–99 Blende Street
- Item I27, Broken Hill Munitions Annex (former), 60 Argent Street
- Item I24, Broken Hill High School (buildings), police house and teacher housing (2 units), 76 Garnet Street and 41 and 43 Wolfram Street
- I209 Sulphide Street Station (Railway Museum), 230 Blende Street.
- I17 Black Lion Hotel (former Federal Hotel),159 Blende Street.

The NSW Heritage Inventory has no information for these items. The information in the following table was provided by Broken Hill City Council²:

Address	LEP	History and Analysis
Description / Name	Item	
97-99 Blende Street	119	The building was erected in 1888 for John Condon as the Adelaide Hotel. It
		later became known as the Adelaide Club Hotel. The Gaiety Theatre noted for
Boarding House		its somewhat bawdy shows was next door to the south east and was closely
		associated with the hotel. The hall was renamed the Empire Hall in December
		1901 and included a picture palace and the Empire Gardens by 1908. The hotel
		building and Empire Hall are clearly visible on the 1910 plan when the hotel was
		flanked on the other side by a boarding house. In 1923 the Empire Hall was taken
		to Bimbowrie Station for use as a shearing shed and the 1932 Fire Plan shows the site occupied by a corrugated iron dwelling. The Adelaide Hotel was delicensed in
		1924.
230 Blende Street	1209	The building was built by the Silverton Tramway Co. as its main passenger
		terminal. Because the railway was privately owned it could not legally use the
Sulphide Street Station		term "railway" in the company name hence it was registered as a tramway.
(Railway Museum)		The company was the most successful and richest privately ownerd railway in
		Australia and was formed to fill the need for a rail link from Broken Hill to the South
		Australian border.
		The first station building was erected in 1888 not long after the Silverton Tramway
		Company started operations in Broken Hill and was built of wood and iron
		construction. This was replaced in 1905 by the present stone building built by
		Messrs. Axtel & Waldie, constructed from local stone (quarried on the Block 14
		mining lease). From the north-east of the building stretching to Sulphide Street
		was a beautifully tended garden set within hedging but this gradually fell into
		disrepair during the 1940s. An early photo of this survives. Internally original
		pressed metal ceilings and cornices survive in original colours and tiled floor
		survives to the entrance hall. There is a Silverton Railway monogram to the
		fanlights. Most original detailing survives including grained joinery, original marble
		mantelpieces, pressed metal ceilings and tiled floors to the bathrooms. In addition
		fine joinery work survives in the ticket office.

2 Email correspondence dated 17 January 2020



159 Blende Street	117	This building was erected in 1900 and was opened on 16th December of that year.
(34 Bromide Street)		This was the last hotel to be opened in Broken Hill but the original licensee was
		in charge for only 4 days before handing over to a new host. It was extensively
Black Lion Hotel		altered to provide a decor approaching that of an old English inn and was
(former Federal Hotel)		renamed the Black Lion in 1971. The rear two storey wing survives largely intact
		and would have provided plentiful accommodation when in its heyday.

Broken Hill High School

The following information relating to Item I24, Broken Hill High School (buildings), police house and teacher housing (2 units) at 76 Garnet Street and 41 and 43 Wolfram Street is sourced from the Register of the National Estate which is a non-statutory archive³:

Nominator's Statement of Significance

The buildings date back almost to the earliest days of this, Broken Hill's first public school. They are generally intact and in [good] condition externally, and retain a variety of original details internally. Their different plans and characters well demonstrate different approaches to hot climate government architecture during the first twenty years of this century.

History

The school was established as Broken Hill Public School in 1886 in a building (since demolished) on the corner of Garnet and Beryl Streets. Within three months of its opening it had nearly 200 pupils. Secondary courses began in 1905 when the school was declared a "District School" one of nineteen in NSW. In 1911, the District School was offering, four years secondary courses, extending to five years in 1918. The property was originally two acres, increased to five and a half acres in 1900 and to ten acres in 1917. In 1944 the grounds were extended to Wolfram Street taking over the old police property. Enrolment peaked at 2,200 in 1973, and was relieved by the opening of Willyama High School in 1974.

The present buildings are a 1900 two storey building on Kaolin Street; a 1907 building facing what was Beryl Street and the Silverton Tramway (this land was passed onto the school after the tramway closed in 1970); a 1919 building on Garnet Street, and a number of other buildings dating from the 1930s, 1960s and 1970s.

Significant Items are:

1900 building: A two storey L-shaped building of face brick in English bond (stretcher bond to the rear wing, suggesting this may be a later addition). A terracotta plaque is inscribed PUBLIC SCHOOL 1900. Gabled corrugated iron roof, chimneys with curved brick copings and roughcast tops, boarded gables ends with vents. Wide verandahs have timber balustrades and a sort of corrugated iron fascia or valance with elegated flared bottom shading the lower storey. Interior has generally original doors, windows, joinery, ripple iron ceilings.

1907 building: A single storey building with typical features of Arts and crafts influence and Far West architecture of the period of Government Architect W.L. Vernon. The building has a base (to about dado height) of random coursed rubble stone with brick quoins, trims and string course; walls above are roughcast rendered. Hipped corrugated iron roof with exposed rafter, central vent and cupola. Double hung small pane windows; round arched openings; wide north and west facing verandahs under the main roof line; battened gable fascia and gable vents; roughcast chimneys with brick string courses. A stone plaque on the south side is inscribed PUBLIC SCHOOL 1907. Interiors have generally original doors, joinery, board ceilings. Interiors were restored 1979.

1919 building: Foundation stone 15 October 1919. Style and details are similar to those of the 1909 building, though the formal U-shaped plan with symmetrical front and long corridors is quite different. It is a single storey building with

³ Register of the National Estate (Non-statutory archive), Place ID 101367

a base section of random coursed rubble and rendered walls with brick quoins. Central gables in the front wing face both the street and the rear courtyard. Corrugated iron roofs; rendered chimneys with decorative brick tops. Wide verandahs face the rear yard

Former Broken Hill Munitions Annex

No inventory information was found for Item I27, the Broken Hill Munitions Annex (former) at 60 Argent Street. This building was constructed in 1942 and produced 637,606 nose cone assemblies for 25 pound shells during its three year operation. In 1946 it was handed over to the Broken hill Technical College and used for the training of apprentices.⁴ It demonstrates the historic themes of defence and manufacturing.

5.5 Broken Hill National Heritage Values

The City of Broken Hill was added to the National Heritage List in 2015. The following information is sourced from the Australian Heritage Database entry for this item, Place Id 105861.⁵

Summary Statement of Significance

The City of Broken Hill has outstanding significance to the nation for its role in creating enormous wealth, for its long, enduring and continuing mining operations, and the community's deep and shared connection with Broken Hill as the isolated city in the desert, its outback landscape, the planned design and landscaping of the town, the regeneration areas and particularly the physical reminders of its mining origins such as the Line of Lode, the barren mullock heaps, tailings, skimps and slagheap escarpment and relict structures. It exhibits historic qualities in its ongoing mining operations since 1883, the current and relict mining infrastructure and its landscape setting. It is significant for its industrial past and the adoption of vanguard industrial relations and management policies, together with its role as a pioneer in setting occupational health and safety standards.

It demonstrates the principal characteristics of a mining town in a remote location with extensive transport infrastructure and administrative connections to three state capitals and as a rare example of a place subject to Australia's complex Federal system where differing administrative, social and economic influences are expressed in both tangible and intangible forms. It has social significance for its residents as a place of community pride, endurance, and as a remote mining community resilient to major social and economic change. Broken Hill has strong social significance for all Australians as a place where great wealth was created, as well as strong group associations with the Barrier Industrial Council. It exhibits outstanding aesthetic characteristics as a city in an arid desert setting, as the subject of interest for Australian artists, poets, film makers, TV producers and photographers.

It has significance as a place where outstanding technical achievement has occurred in refining ore for its minerals including the froth flotation process and the computer controlled on-stream analysis of slurries. Broken Hill is also important as a place of research potential to reveal further information on mineral deposits with its range of complex minerals, It is associated with persons of great importance to Australia's history, including Albert Morris (arid land regeneration), Charles Rasp (discoverer), Herbert Hoover (mining engineer), WL Baillieu, WS Robinson and MAE Mawby (industrialists), GD Delprat (metallurgist), Percy Brookfield and Eugene O'Neill (unionists). Broken Hill's association with the Barrier Industrial Council as a group is also important.

The Broken Hill zinc-lead-silver ore deposit is one of the world's largest ore bodies and contains an extraordinary array of minerals. It is geologically complex and has national scientific significance. The Broken Hill operation is significant for its immense size and unrecorded mineral species continue to be found. It contributes to an understanding of the formation of the Australian continent and more than 2,300 million years of the earth's history.

Official Values

Criterion A Events, Processes

The City of Broken Hill contains one of the world's largest deposits of silver/lead/zinc ore bodies. Discovered by Charles Rasp, boundary rider and prospector, Broken Hill continues to be mined today (2010), over 125 years since its discovery in 1883.

The City of Broken Hill is an exciting geological area of national and international renown. It provides a window into 2,300 million years of Earth's history and has recorded the landscapes and geological environments which have evolved in response to eons of geo-chronologic changes.

4 Kearns R H B, *Broken Hill 1940-1983*,pages 7-8

5 http://www.environment.gov.au/cgi-bin/ahdb/search.pl?mode=place_detail;place_id=105861

In the field of mineralogy the Broken Hill deposit has achieved its widest international recognition as one of the world's great "mineralogical rainforests" with approximately 300 mineral species reliably confirmed from the ore body. The Broken Hill ore body is geologically complex, however characteristic environments where minerals exist include the outcropping gossan (the weathered, ragged black outcrop) and the secondary zone. The gossan from the main Line of Lode has national significance for its immense size, and enormous suite of minerals.

The Broken Hill mines have played a decisive role in Australia's mining history and Australia's national development. The wealth and expertise generated by mining at Broken Hill over such a long period has contributed markedly to Australia becoming well known as one of the world's major providers of raw materials. Broken Hill played a decisive role in the origin and growth of some of the world's largest and wealthiest companies, Broken Hill Proprietary Company Limited (now BHP Billiton), Rio Tinto and Pasminco Ltd. Broken Hill is one of Australia's longest lasting mining fields compared with the average life of a mine of some 20 years. The continuous nature of large scale mining over so many years (125) is unique in the Australian context, a record not matched by other mining areas.

The Line of Lode proved to be one of the largest silver, lead and zinc mineral deposits in the world. The on-going exploration of the Line of Lode from 1883 provided the basis for the commercial prosperity of the Broken Hill township and the mines that exploited the ore. The continuation of mining activity in Broken Hill is important for the economic prosperity of the city and contributes to its national significance.

The significance of the mining industry to Broken Hill and the nation is represented by the ongoing mining operations, the barren topographical profile, scale and landform of the mullock heaps along the Line of Lode, the Line of Lode itself and the extensive mining leases.

Broken Hill has contributed several world ranking innovative mining and metallurgical practices which were to benefit later lead and zinc mines. In particular, the development and application of the froth flotation processes and the computer controlled on-stream analysis of slurries using radio isotope probes are of world renown. Two generations of professional and technical staff and experienced miners who were trained at Broken Hill subsequently went on to develop other ore bodies in Australia and overseas. The Broken Hill experience generated expertise which spread into many metalliferous and coal mining, engineering, chemical and manufacturing industries, notably steel and its associated industries. The significance of innovative mining practices is demonstrated by the relict mining infrastructure.

Broken Hill is significant as the place where safe working practices legislation and occupational health and safety provisions for workers, particularly miners was developed. Broken Hill has been described as the 'bastion of unionism' and was the site of the two longest miners' strikes (1909 and 1919-20) in Australia's industrial history. The 1919-20 strike of over 600 days resulted in significant gains for the miners: the 35 hour week, and improved underground health and safe working conditions. Some of these gains eventually flowed to other workers throughout Australia. Evidence of the strength of the union movement in Broken Hill is represented by the Barrier Industrial Council, the Trades Hall and the Amalgamated Miners Association Hall, archives held in the Broken Hill City Library and the Barrier Industrial Council's collection of movable cultural heritage, together with the records of the Barrier Daily Truth.

Legislation aimed to protect the community from lead poisoning. However, it was left to the mining companies such as the Sulphide Corporation and the Zinc Corporation rather than the law to implement social welfare programs such as the provision of recreational amenities. Housing demand generated by increased mining activity and the sudden growth of population in the late 19th and early 20th century gave rise to strong support for privately organised co-operative workers housing schemes. In addition, mining companies provided low interest loans for employee housing as well as establishing housing co-operatives and constructing housing for senior staff. Community amenities and housing need is represented by recreational facilities provided by the Zinc Corporation and mine workers' housing schemes.

Other measures aimed at improving the amenity of the Broken Hill community came from the work undertaken by Albert Morris and applied by the Zinc Corporation. As a private individual, and with mining company support, he experimented by fencing and planting areas with native species and showed how regeneration of the denuded landscape could combat the impact of devastating dust storms. This far-sighted innovative regeneration work by Morris from 1936 led the Zinc Corporation to apply regeneration practices at Broken Hill. Subsequently the precedent was used by mining companies and spread throughout Australia, particularly in arid zones.

Albert Morris pioneered research into the propagation and planting of native and exotic species that would grow in arid and semi arid locations. He promoted ideas for 'green belts' in Broken Hill. Regeneration schemes, planted to protect Broken Hill from major dust storms, now partially surround the City and continue the intent of the program to revegetate the surrounding landscape degraded through removal of vegetation cover for mining operations and heavy grazing. The significance of Morris' work is demonstrated by the plantations, the creation of popular recreational facilities and the extensive regeneration areas surrounding Broken Hill.

An adequate water supply for Broken Hill, a constant concern from the 1880s onwards for both the population and for mining functions, was dogged by official dilatoriness. Initially water was provided from soakage sites, then carted in to Broken Hill on the Silverton Tramway as well as being piped from Government dams, and provided separately by private enterprises. A Government funded 99km pipeline from Menindee (1952) provides a water supply which permits an enhanced level of civic amenity and parkland irrigation, as well as providing for ongoing mining operations.

The remoteness of Broken Hill posed significant difficulties for transporting ore and concentrates to sea ports. In 1886, to overcome the impasse between the railway interests of NSW and South Australia, the mining companies, using the Victorian Companies Act, established the Silverton Tramway Company Ltd. This narrow gauge track, via Silverton (NSW) and Cockburn (SA) focussed Broken Hill exports on the South Australian town of Port Pirie and drew the community of Broken Hill into the Adelaide and South Australian sphere of influence. In 1927 NSW eventually connected its standard gauge rail network to Broken Hill providing links to Newcastle and the steel works in that city. In 1970 the east-west railway corridor was completed establishing a standard gauge connection from Sydney to Perth, with a major stop at Broken Hill. The Silverton Tramway Company is represented by the Broken Hill Railway Museum and its collection in Sulphide Street and the standard gauge east-west link is represented by the Broken Hill railway station in Crystal Street and adjacent railway infrastructure. The very remoteness of Broken Hill was the reason for its use during WW II as the site to store Australia's gold bullion reserves.

Elements which embody events and processes include the complex geology and mineral deposits, ongoing mining operations and their ever-changing nature, adaptive re-use of mining facilities, relict mining infrastructure, the Line of Lode and remaining gossan outcrops, and mining leases, the city layout within the planned urban grid and tree lined streets, the residential character, mining company housing and the revegetation areas.

Criterion B Rarity

Broken Hill is unique amongst Australian geological deposits for its mineralogical diversity. Broken Hill is the type locality for 19 mineral species, including many rare and uncommon species. The secondary zone of the Broken Hill ore body contains an extensive array of extremely rare well-crystallised minerals, and unrecorded species continue to be found. The rarity of Broken Hill's mineralogy is demonstrated by its mineral deposits and the records of the mining companies.

Broken Hill is a rare example of a long established, almost continuously operated mining town, with a long industrial history and strong union representation. The industrial actions of unions focussed on protecting jobs, improving community amenity and achieving safe and healthy conditions for workers within the mining industry and for workers generally is at a level of intensity unmatched elsewhere in Australia. Broken Hill is also unusual for the way that the Barrier Industrial Council emerged as a social, regulatory and economic force bringing together a range of craft based unions and able to dictate who worked in Broken Hill by: ensuring preferential employment for the locally born; supporting the provision of particular services; and controlling the extent of retail competition. The Barrier Industrial Council policy of not permitting married women to work in Broken Hill survived until a legal challenge forced a change. The rarity of Broken Hill as a town with its strong union presence is represented by the continuing operation of the Barrier Industrial Council, occupational health and safety legislation and safe working practices. The union movement in Broken Hill is also represented by its association with and ownership of the Barrier Daily Truth. Significant fabric representing the past role and ongoing activities of the union movement includes the Trades Hall, the former Broken Hill Council Chambers and the Amalgamated Miners Association Hall.

Broken Hill is a rare example of Australia's complex federal system. Located in the far west of the state, NSW and the Broken Hill City Council provide water and sewer infrastructure and a representative from Broken Hill sits in the NSW Parliament. However, Broken Hill is serviced by rail primarily from South Australia, keeps Central Australian time and Adelaide is its nearest capital city. In the late 19th and early 20th centuries financial interests for Broken Hill mining companies were managed from Melbourne in Victoria, and London provided investment capital. This unusual mix is reflected in the architecture of Broken Hill buildings, where official buildings have recognisable NSW Government Architect characteristics, the residential buildings exhibit design and construction characteristics derived from South Australia, and commercial buildings, such as hotels, show characteristics from Melbourne's late Victorian architectural period.

The example of Broken Hill as an isolated community is emphasised by the unusual measure of transferring gold bullion from coastal capitals during World War II. Its remoteness from sites of possible invasion by the Japanese was seen as a distinct advantage. Australia's gold reserves were stored in Broken Hill from 1942 until 1945 and this transfer was the largest single transfer of gold ever carried out in Australia.

Broken Hill is a rare example of a mining town where 'green belt' regeneration measures were researched, tested and implemented. From the 1930s onwards with the assistance of mining companies, the revegetation of denuded areas adjacent to its urban areas was trialled and shown effective in reducing the adverse effect on dust storms. Albert Morris tested native and exotic species for their capacity to survive arid and semi arid conditions.

Criterion C Research

Broken Hill has important research potential for further investigation into its innovative mining practices, its mineralogy and geology, its history of unionism and development of safe mining practices, and its social characteristics.

A large collection of mining records and associated material is available to provide information on the methods of construction and the economic reasons for developing and mining along the Line of Lode. This collection has the potential to contribute further to the technical advancement of mining. Mining company records provide research potential into the history and discovery of innovative processes such as the froth flotation. The wide range of relict mining infrastructure on and in the vicinity of the Line of Lode, and the extensive documentary records make the place an important source of information on the development of mining practices, processes, technological advancement, and working conditions. The mining companies are custodians of considerable records of mining operations.

Mining and research on the Broken Hill ore body spans an exceptional 120 years, and previously unrecorded mineral species continue to be discovered. Scientific research continues to generate important outcomes including new concepts in ore genesis. Research on the diverse and complex geology of Broken Hill contributes to an understanding of the formation of the Australian continent and more than 2300 million years of the Earth's history.

Systematic corporate collecting of unique specimens in the last two decades at Broken Hill has resulted in a valuable repository of, and resource for investigation into, Australia's mineralogical heritage. The Line of Lode is significant for the scientific research potential of the numbers and types of rare minerals found associated with the mineral ore body. Opportunities exist for further research into methods for the efficient extraction of minerals and processes for the treatment of ore bodies.

The research values of Broken Hill are represented by mining company and union records.

Criterion D Principal characteristics of a class of places

Broken Hill demonstrates the principal characteristics of an evolving mining town. With populations ranging from its early beginning to approximately 35,000 in 1915, to its current population of approximately 20,000 it represents a typical example of mining town growth and contraction, depending on economic circumstances, metal prices, supply and demand, and competition.

In 1886, within three years of the discovery of the ore bodies, Broken Hill had been surveyed and a town plan gazetted, adapting the rectilinear town planning grid pattern regulations promulgated by Governor Darling in 1829 for the layout of rural townships. The Broken Hill town plan flanks the Line of Lode and generally parallels the mining leases. Broken Hill municipality was incorporated in 1888 and it was proclaimed a city in 1907. The urban plan of Broken Hill is represented by the wide streets, some doubling as drainage channels to cater for the run off from sudden storms, and the rectilinear grid street pattern.

The principal characteristics also include changes to the geo-chronological environment; relict mining infrastructure and the ever-changing nature of the results of mining activity as mining processes change; the patterns of mining leases aligned to the Line of Lode ore body; an administrative and commercial service centre historically based on the mining industry but diversified to service extensive pastoral interests; provision of residential accommodation in proximity to work locations; and despite its remoteness, extensive road, rail and air transportation links to Sydney, Adelaide and Melbourne. The grid pattern town layout has shown itself to be robust and flexible, standing the test of time and responding to social and technological change over 124 years.

The characteristics that represent a mining town are also represented by continuing mining operations and their ever-changing nature, the remaining gossan outcrops of the Line of Lode, its relict mining infrastructure, all modes of road and rail transport infrastructure and its role as a centre for the Royal Flying Doctor Service.

Although the Broken Hill ore body is geologically complex, it also contains characteristic environments where minerals occur in the outcropping gossan (the weathered, ragged black outcrop of the ore body- the 'Broken Hill').

Criterion E Aesthetic characteristics

The distinctive aesthetic qualities of the Broken Hill include the mining landscape and the remaining bulk and scale of the Line of Lode with its relict mining infrastructure dominating and in such close proximity to the surrounding townscape, all set in a vast arid landscape. This visual representation of mining activity on the surface and the barren character of the remaining mullock dumps identifies the physical location of the Line of Lode and the below surface mining of the layered mineral deposits.

Broken Hill is a visually cohesive town with late Victorian and Federation era administrative and commercial buildings reflecting the mining wealth, and an unusually uniform and singular scale of residential housing with pockets of 'tin' architecture. The aesthetic urban qualities contrast with the surrounding belts of revegetated countryside, all set in an arid desert landscape in which the vivid colours, brilliant light and vast horizons stretch well beyond the city. The contrast between the built up area and the dominating arid desert landscape is heightened by the sharp, orthogonally distinctive abrupt urban edge.

Broken Hill is a popular centre for artists, poets, film-makers and TV producers and is recognised as a major focus for artistic endeavour. The 'Brushmen of the Bush' is a group of Australian artists located in Broken Hill who popularised paintings of outback Australia. Several major Australian artists with works included in Australian and overseas galleries and private collections are associated with depicting the enthrallingly stark Broken Hill environment. Australian film makers have used Broken Hill and its landscape setting for major and popular works. Through their paintings, poetry, films and TV productions these artists and producers with their nationally recognised reputations demonstrate the strength of their understanding and appreciation of the aesthetic characteristics of Broken Hill and its desert setting.

The aesthetic significance of Broken Hill is demonstrated by: the dramatic and spectacular but ever-changing landscape form and the still massive scale of the barren mullock dumps along the Line of Lode so close to the central business area of the city; the design qualities of the streetscapes; the distinctive character of existing and relict mining infrastructure; and the unusual visual qualities of 'tin' residential and mining architecture. Other features representing the aesthetic significance are the contrast between the scale of the mullock dumps and the central business townscape, both dwarfed by the grander scale of the vast outback landscape setting; the views to and from the Line of Lode along streets and from distant hills; together with close and distant views of mining markers, such as headframes, and mining industry relics. All these factors combined offer evocative and tangible evidence of Broken Hill's industrial character contrasting with its remote landscape setting. Other aesthetic features include historic nineteenth and twentieth century buildings and precincts and the park vistas and streetscapes with memorials and artwork.

Criterion F Creative or technical achievement

Over many years Broken Hill has been the source of much of the world's knowledge on the extraction of minerals and the application of scientific method to separate minerals from the base ore. The advancement and improvement of mining practices, innovative experimentation in design of industrial plant and buildings, as well as the discovery of new methods of treating difficult ores and the introduction to Australia of overseas practices includes: the use of square set timbering to overcome the problem of unstable ground; the introduction of the froth flotation process for separating mineral ores for the recovery of zinc concentrates from tailings dumps; the selective separation of lead and zinc from refined ore, the selective separation of lead and zinc from the ore as mined; the roasting of slimes to assist in de-sulphurising the slimes; the reutilisation of slimes through a 'sand plant' whereby slimes were used for backfilling stopes instead of mullock; and pioneering use of rising (slip) form for reinforced concrete; and pioneering the computer controlled on-stream analysis of slurries using radio isotope probes.

Broken Hill research and development expertise spread into major metalliferous and coal mining, engineering, chemical and manufacturing industries, notably the steel industry, lead smelting and the electrolytic zinc smelting process. These technological advances also had application for refractories, and for other industrial processes such as timber milling, the production of paper, the manufacture of fertilisers, and cement, as well as for shipping and aircraft. Continuing technological development of mining practices and processes have the potential to enhance the technical achievement values of the place.

The work of Albert Morris, eventually supported by mine management, in researching, validating and subsequently implementing regeneration measures to protect both the residential and mining areas from devastating dust storms is a major technical achievement. Hi work, recognised nationally and internationally, is evident in the 'green belt' surrounding Broken Hill. Regeneration areas, following the principles established by Morris, now provide an edge to Broken Hill urban areas, particularly on the north-western and south-western boundaries.

The record of technical achievement is represented by the mining records of mining companies and other academic and community archives. It is also represented by relevant relict mining structures that demonstrate the advancement of technological practices that were invented, applied and/or pioneered at Broken Hill.

Criterion G Social value

The City of Broken Hill is valued for its strong community spirit, self reliance and for exhibiting the resilience of a remote inland community. For the Australian community Broken Hill symbolises the importance of the Broken Hill mines to the wealth of Australia. Broken Hill also symbolises the challenges and remoteness of the outback, which is a defining element for the community.

The steep, barren and dominating mullock heaps, tailings, skimps and slagheap along the Line of Lode and the remnant outcrops of the Line of Lode gossan are highly valued by the community as the industrial and economic heart of the city, and as the reason for Broken Hill's existence. The combination of the dramatic mining infrastructure set in the arid desert plain and undulating landscape of the region is found in visual images, paintings, photographs and films. This imagery is highly valued by the local Broken Hill community and widely recognised by the wider Australian community.

There is a deep, enduring and shared link between the existing community, past residents and the 'city in the desert'. This strength, depth and long-held connection between the community and the place Broken Hill and its outback landscape is made tangible by: its remoteness; the design and landscaping of the town with its 'oasis' like character and regeneration areas; an appreciation of the distinctive residential 'tin' architecture recalling the harsh living conditions; and the murals, public art and memorials located throughout the urban area.

The social value of Broken Hill is represented by pride in being a Broken Hill resident; the continuous and ongoing mining operations; the adaptation of mining facilities for re-activated or new mining operations; and the resilience of the community to adapt to change and deal with its remoteness in times of adversity. These qualities are represented by the mullock heaps along the Line of Lode, the remaining gossan outcrops of the Line of Lode, the Line of Lode itself; relict mining infrastructure; the extensive arid landscape setting; and the civic amenity and community facilities provided through Broken Hill's planned urban land uses.

Criterion H Significant people

The City of Broken Hill is important for its associations with many individuals who have played a prominent role in the Australian mining industry. Significant people include the lode's discoverer, Charles Rasp; engineer and metallurgist GD Delprat; the American mining engineer Herbert Hoover; Australian industrialists WL Baillieu, WS Robinson and MAE Mawby, union organisers Percy Brookfield and Eugene O'Neill and environmentalist Albert Morris. As a group, the Barrier Industrial Council is also important for its association with Broken Hill.

The significance of important people and groups is represented by their association with mining the Line of Lode, ongoing mining operations, relict mining infrastructure, mining leases, local government and mining records, Barrier Industrial Council records, regeneration areas and Broken Hill City Council records.

5.6 Consideration of the Guidelines of the NSW Heritage Division

The NSW Heritage Office (now part of the NSW Department of Premier and Cabinet) has published a series of criteria for the assessment of heritage impact. The relevant 'questions to be answered' in the *NSW Heritage Manual* 'Statements of Heritage Impact' guidelines relating to development in conservation areas and adjacent to a heritage item have been considered in the preparation of the following commentary.

Minor / Major Additions (to a conservation area)

- How is the impact of the addition on the heritage significance of the item to be minimised?
- Can the additional area be located within an existing structure? If no, why not?
- Will the additions tend to visually dominate the heritage item?
- Is the addition sited on any know, or potentially significant archaeological deposits? If so, have alternative positions for the additions been considered?
- Are the additions sympathetic to the heritage item? In what way (eg form, proportions, design)?

The proposal is for a new, purpose built Police Station on the subject site, located at the outer (south west) edge of the Argent Street Heritage Conservation Area.

The existing Police Station at 252 Argent Street is part of a group of significant civic buildings on the western side of the street between Sulphide and Chloride Streets. This building was initially constructed in 1890 to the a design of Colonial Architect James Barnett and a second storey was added in 1908 with a arcaded brick verandah added circa 1920.⁶ It is no longer fit for purpose and the alterations and additions necessary to provide facilities that meet contemporary community and workforce requirements would compromise the integrity of the building.

The subject site is separated from the existing buildings in the conservation area by Blende Street, a wide, main thoroughfare. With the exception of the heritage listed Boarding House (former Adelaide Hotel) at 97-99 Blende Street and the former Munitions Annex, the significant buildings in the conservation area are well removed from the subject site, in Blende Street north of Bromide Street and in Argent and Crystal Streets. Given its location and separation from these building, the proposed new, two level building will not visually dominate the conservation area.

The two storey form and the design of the new building with shading devices and metal cladding reminiscent of the vernacular buildings of Broken Hill are considered to be sympathetic to the significance of the conservation area.

Although Archaeological Assessment is outside the scope of this report, it is noted that there have been no known buildings on this site. However, as the Archaeological Management Provisions of the *NSW Heritage Act* apply to any relics which are essentially located below ground level, should any unexpected archaeological remains be uncovered or disturbed, during site works, the work must stop immediately and the NSW Heritage Council must be notified.

⁶ McDougall and Vines, Argent Street Urban Design Study Heritage Analysis Volume 2, 1988

New Development Adjacent to a Heritage Item

- How is the impact of the new development on the heritage significance of the item or area to be minimised?
- Why is the new development required to be adjacent to a heritage item?
- How does the curtilage allowed around the heritage item contribute to the retention of its heritage significance?
- How does the new development affect views to, and from, the heritage item? What has been done to minimise negative effects?
- Is the development sited on any known, or potentially significant archaeological deposits? If so, have alternative sites been considered? Why were they rejected?
- Is the new development sympathetic to the heritage item? In what way (e.g. form, siting, proportions, design)?
- Will the additions visually dominate the heritage item? How has this been minimised?
- Will the public, and users of the item, still be able to view and appreciate its significance?

The likely impact of the proposal on its surroundings, including the heritage items in its vicinity, is considered to be low and no additional measures are deemed necessary to minimise any impact.

There will be no changes to the existing curtilages around the heritage items in the vicinity of the site and the proposed development is well removed from the heritage listed buildings and structure. As such, they will not be visually dominated by the proposed new building. The proposed building has no historical relationship with the listed items in its vicinity.

The public and users of these items will still be able to view and appreciate their significance from the surrounding streets.

Further comment on the potential heritage impacts of the proposed development on the individual heritage items in the vicinity of the site is included in the following table. The location of these items in relation to the subject site is illustrated in Figure 3.1

Item	Comment
I84 Kintore Headframe and Kintore Reserve 51 Bromide Street	The 2019 subdivision of 51 Bromide Street reduced the curtilage of Kintore Reserve to be the boundaries of Lot 92, DP 1262315, the northern half of the street block bounded by Kaolin, Beryl, Bromide and Blende Street. The subject site, Lot 91, DP 1262315, is the southern half of this street block.
	The proposed new building on the subject site has an extensive setback from the site's boundary with Kintore Reserve and is to be located near the Kaolin Street end of the site. It will be visible from within some parts of Kintore Reserve.
	The Kintore Headframe is setback approximately 20 metres from the boundary with the subject site. This allows uninterrupted views of the headframe to be appreciated from Blende and Beryl Streets.
	Some views to the Kintore Headframe from the northern side of Kaolin Street, immediately in front of the proposed building will be obscured. This is considered to be acceptable from a heritage perspective given the extensive views available in the surrounding streets and the wider locality. The historic, aesthetic and social significance of the Kintore Headframe and Reserve will be retained.
119	The Boarding House (former Adelaide Hotel) at 97-99 Blende Street is opposite Kintore Reserve.
Boarding House (former Adelaide Hotel)	Views to this item will not be obscured or interrupted by the proposed development. The Blende Street elevation of the new building will be
97-99 Blende Street	seen in views looking south west from outside this building. This will not have an adverse impact on its established historical significance.

I27 Broken Hill Munitions Annex (former) 60 Argent Street	The former Broken Hill Munitions Annex was constructed to address Argent Street. There is a visual connection between the rear of the property on which it is located and the subject site, across the intersection of Blende and Kaolin Streets. The new building proposed on the subject site will not affect the setting of this item, or views to or from it. There will be no adverse impact on the historic significance of this item.
I24Broken Hill High School (buildings), police housing and teacher housing (2 units)76 Garnet Street and 41 and 43 Wolfram Street	The 1907 School Building can be seen in the background of some views from Kaolin and Blende Streets in the vicinity of the subject site. Views to this building will not be obscured or interrupted by the proposed development. The Kaolin and Beryl Street elevations of the new building will be seen in views looking north from the within the school grounds. This will not have an adverse impact on the established historical and aesthetic significance of the significant elements of this item.
I209 Sulphide Street Station 230 Blende Street	Sulphide Street Station is north of the subject site, separated by Kintore Reserve and the width of Bromide Street. The building, remnant track and rolling stock and memorabilia are physical evidence of the Silverton Tramway Company operation in Broken Hill. The use of the site as a railway museum allows this aspect of Broken Hill's history to be communicated to the public, along with several other collections. The new building proposed for the subject site will not affect the setting of this item, or views to or from it. There will be no adverse impact on the historic significance of this item.
I17Black Lion Hotel (former Federal Hotel)159 Blende Street	The Black Lion Hotel is located north east of the subject site at the corner of Blende and Bromide Streets. The new building proposed on the subject site will not affect the setting of this item, or views to or from it. There will be no adverse impact on the historic significance of this item.

5.7 Heritage Objectives of the Broken Hill LEP 2013

The proposed development is considered to be acceptable, from a heritage perspective, for the following reasons:

- the form and the design of the proposed building are considered to be sympathetic to the significance of the Argent Street Heritage Conservation Area
- the proposed building will not visually dominate the Argent Street Heritage Conservation Area, or the listed heritage items in its vicinity
- primary views to the listed heritage items in the vicinity of the subject site will be retained

• the proposed development will not have an adverse impact on the setting or established heritage significance of the Argent Street Heritage Conservation Area, or the listed items in its vicinity.

The proposal is, therefore, considered to be consistent with the relevant heritage objectives of the *Broken Hill LEP 2013*, which are:

5.10 Heritage conservation

(1) Objectives

The objectives of this clause are as follows:

(a) to conserve the environmental heritage of Broken Hill,

(b) to conserve the heritage significance of heritage items and heritage conservation areas, including associated fabric, settings and views,

5.8 Heritage Guidelines of the Broken Hill DCP 2016

The proposed development is generally consistent with the relevant heritage objectives of the *Broken Hill DCP* 2016 which are:

3.3 Development in business zones

• to ensure the conservation and enhancement of the historic, architectural and aesthetic character of the City, particularly the City Centre Commercial Precinct

8 Heritage Conservation

- To conserve items of environmental heritage and maintain appropriate settings and views.
- To retain evidence of historic themes of development evident in Broken Hill through the proper care and maintenance of individual items of environmental heritage and Heritage Conservation Areas.
- to encourage new development which complements existing heritage items and Conservation Areas in a current day context.

5.9 Requirements of the EPBC Act 1999

Sites on the National Heritage List (NHL) are protected by the *Environment Protection and Biodiversity Conservation Act 1999 (EPBC Act)*. Actions (the definition of which includes development) that have, or are likely to have, a significant impact on a matter of national environmental significance require approval from the Australian Government Minister for the Department of Agriculture, Water and the Environment. The minister decides whether assessment and approval is required under the *EPBC Act*.

The inclusion of Broken Hill on the NHL recognises the value of the City's mining operations, its contribution to technical developments in the field of mining, its pioneering role in the development of occupational health and safety standards, its early practice of regenerating the environment in and around mining operations, its characteristics as an evolving mining town and the aesthetic qualities of its town centre, as noted in Section 5.5 above.

The *EPBC Act* provides a legal framework to protect and manage nationally and internationally important flora, fauna, ecological communities and heritage places — defined in the *EPBC Act* as matters of national environmental significance. The Significant Impact Guidelines state that an action is likely to have a significant impact on the National Heritage values of a National Heritage place if there is a real chance or possibility that it will cause:

- one or more of the National Heritage values to be lost
- one or more of the National Heritage values to be degraded or damaged
- one or more of the National Heritage values to be notably altered, modified, obscured or diminished.

The Federal Government publication *Matters of National Environmental Significance Significant Impact Guidelines 1.1 Environment Protection and Biodiversity Conservation Act 1999* notes the following matters are to be considered in a 'Self Assessment Process' when making decisions as to whether or not to refer an action to the Minister for assessment:

1. Are there any matters of national environmental significance located in the area of the proposed action?

2. Considering the proposed action at its broadest scope (that is, considering all stages and components of the action, and all related activities and infrastructure), is there potential for impacts, including indirect impacts, on matters of national environmental significance?

3. Are there any proposed measures to avoid or reduce impacts on matters of national environmental significance (and if so, is the effectiveness of these measures certain enough to reduce the level of impact below the 'significant impact threshold)?

4. Are any impacts of the proposed action on matters of national environmental significance likely to be significant impacts (important, notable, or of consequence, having regard to their context or intensity)?

The "action" in this instance is the construction of the proposed new Police Station on the subject site.

As the proposed new facilities are to be contained wholly within an existing allotment, the proposed Police Station will not affect the existing urban plan of Broken Hill.

The proposal to consolidate the area's policing facilities in a new, purpose built facility away from the visually cohesive town centre in Argent Streets retains the aesthetic character of the existing group of civic buildings that include the existing Police Station.

The new, two level, infill building to be constructed on the subject site, at the outer edge of the town centre, will not obscure views to, or from, the Line of Load along streets or from the distant hills (see Figure 3.22 and 3.23).

The new building design features shading devices and metal cladding reminiscent of the vernacular buildings of Broken Hill. It will be a positive contribution to the urban form of the city as it continues to evolve to meet the contemporary service requirements of its inhabitants.

Having considered the identified national heritage values of the City of Broken Hill, it is concluded that this proposal will not cause one or more of the National Heritage values of Broken Hill to be lost, one or more of the National Heritage values to be degraded or damaged or one or more of the National Heritage values to be notably altered, modified, obscured or diminished.

As the proposed development will not have a significant impact upon the National Heritage values of the City of Broken Hill it is not likely to be a controlled action requiring referral for approval under the *EPBC Act*.

The ultimate responsibility for deciding whether or not to refer an action remains with the person proposing to take the action. To remove any risk of delay in the project timeline that may result should this conclusion be challenged the proponent could request written confirmation from the Australian Government Department of Environment and Energy that a referral is not required.

6.0 CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

6.1 Conclusions

- The subject site, in Blende Street, Broken Hill, was formerly part of Lot 5893, DP 241855, known as 51 Bromide Street, which is listed in Schedule 5 of the *Broken Hill LEP 2013* as Item I84, Kintore Headframe and Kintore Reserve.
- Although the LEP Heritage Map shows the whole of the street block bounded by Kaolin, Beryl, Bromide and Blende Streets as being Item I84, the 2019 subdivision of this land has reduced the curtilage of Kintore Reserve to the boundaries of Lot 92, DP 1262315.
- The subject site, Lot 91, DP 1262315, is a parcel of vacant land adjoining Kintore Reserve.
- It is located at the outer (south-west) edge of the Argent Street Heritage Conservation Area and is in the vicinity of a the following listed heritage items: Item I19, Boarding house, 97–99 Blende Street, Item I27, Broken Hill Munitions Annex (former), 60 Argent Street, Item I24, Broken Hill High School (buildings), police house and teacher housing (2 units), 76 Garnet Street and 41 and 43 Wolfram Street, I209 Sulphide Street Station (Railway Museum), 230 Blende Street and I17 Black Lion Hotel (former Federal Hotel),159 Blende Street.
- Other listed heritage items in the wider locality are physically and visually separated from the subject site by roadways and intervening development.
- The proposal is for a new, purpose built Police Station, that will consolidate all areas of crime management and police administration in Broken Hill on a single site.
- The form and design of the proposed building are considered to be sympathetic to the significance of the Argent Street Heritage Conservation Area.
- The proposed building will not visually dominate the Argent Street Heritage Conservation Area, or the listed heritage items in its vicinity.
- Primary views to the listed heritage items in the vicinity of the subject site will be retained.
- The proposed development will not have an adverse impact on the setting or established heritage significance of the Argent Street Heritage Conservation Area, or the listed items in its vicinity.
- The proposed development is consistent with the heritage requirements and guidelines of the *Broken Hill LEP 2013* and the *Broken Hill LEP 2016*.
- As the subject site is not included on the New South Wales State Heritage Register (SHR) there are no heritage approvals required under the *NSW Heritage Act 1977* other than those that may be applicable to archaeology.
- Should any unexpected relics be disturbed during excavation of the site, they must be managed under the Archaeological provisions of the *NSW Heritage Act.*

- The whole of the City of Broken Hill Local Government Area is included on the National Heritage List (NHL).
- This proposal will not cause one or more of the identified National Heritage values of Broken Hill to be lost, one or more of the National Heritage values to be degraded or damaged or one or more of the National Heritage values to be notably altered, modified, obscured or diminished.
- As the proposed development will not have a significant impact upon the National Heritage values of the City of Broken Hill it is not likely to be a controlled action requiring referral for approval under the *EPBC Act*.
- The ultimate responsibility for deciding whether or not to refer an action for approval under the *EPBC Act*. remains with the person proposing to take the action. To remove any risk of delay in the project timeline that may result should the conclusion that this is not necessary be challenged, the proponent could request written confirmation from the Australian Government Department of Agriculture, Water and the Environment that a referral is not required.

6.2 **Recommendations**

- Lynch Heritage Consulting has no hesitation in recommending the application to Broken Hill City Council for approval.
- It is recommended that Council update the Schedule 5 entry for Kintore Headframe and Kintore Reserve, and the associated mapping, to reflect the current Lot and DP in the next amendment of the *Broken Hill LEP 2013*.

7.0 **BIBLIOGRAPHY**

BOOKS and PUBLICATIONS

Apperly R, Irving R, Reynolds P, A Pictorial Guide to Identifying Australian Architecture Styles and Terms from 1788 to the Present, NSW, Angus & Robertson, 2002

Austral Archaeology, Broken Hill Line of Load Identification Study Volume 1, December 1994

Austral Archaeology, Broken Hill Line of Load Identification Study Volume 2, December 1994

Broken Hill City Council, Broken Hill Development Control Plan 2016, Broken Hill City Council, 2016

Broken Hill City Council, Broken Hill Local Environmental Plan 2013, Broken Hill City Council, 2013

Commonwealth of Australia, *Matters of National Environmental Significance Significant Impact Guidelines 1.1* Environment Protection and Biodiversity Conservation Act 1999, 2013

Heritage Council of NSW and Government Architect of NSW, *Better Placed, Design Guide for Heritage,* January 2019

High Ground Consulting, Broken Hill City Council Heritage Assessment and Analysis, 2008

ICOMOS Australia, *The Burra Charter: The Australia ICOMOS Charter for the Conservation of Places of Cultural Significance (Burra Charter)*, Australia ICOMOS, 2013

Kearns R H B, Broken Hill 1883-1893, Broken Hill Historical Society, 1996 reprint

Kearns R H B, Broken Hill 1894-1914, Broken Hill Historical Society, 1993 reprint

Kearns R H B, Broken Hill 1915-1939, Broken Hill Historical Society, 1997 reprint

Kearns R H B, Broken Hill 1840-1983, Broken Hill Historical Society, 1987 edition

Latona Masterman and Associates, A Tale of Tin and Silver Broken Hill Heritage Study, 1987

Mayne-Wilson W, *Heritage Curtilages*, NSW Heritage Office and the Department of Urban Affairs and Planning, NSW, 1996

McDougall and Vines, Argent Street Urban Design Study, Volumes One, Two and Three, 1988

NSW Heritage Office and Department of Infrastructure Planning and Natural Resources, *NSW Heritage Manual*, Sydney, 2001

NSW Heritage Office and the Royal Australian Institute of Architects, Design in Context, 2006

Roberts L, Rails to Wealth the Story of the Silverton Tramway Company 1886-1972, Griffin Press, 1995

Solomon R J, The Richest Lode Broken Hill 1883-1988, Austral Books, 2008 reprint

WEBSITES

Architecuture and Design, https://www.architectureanddesign.com.au/news/conrad-gargett-designed-modular-hospital-opens-in

ArchitectureAU, https://architectureau.com/articles/line-of-lode/ and https://architectureau.com/articles/walter-burley-griffin-award-for-urban-design-8/ CHC

Australian Dictionary of Biography, http://adb.anu.edu.au

Australian Heritage Database, https://www.environment.gov.au/heritage/publications/australian-heritage-database

National Library of Australia - Trove, http://trove.nla.gov.au

NSW Government Legislation, www.legislation.nsw.gov.au

NSW Heritage Inventory, http://www.environment.nsw.gov.au/heritageapp/heritagesearch.aspx

NSW Land Registry Services Historic Land Records Viewer, https://hlrv.nswlrs.com.au/

NSW Land Registry Services SIX Maps, www.six.nsw.gov.au

NSW State Library, https://www.sl.nsw.gov.au/